Comment on “Ramsey Fringes in a Bose-Einstein Condensate between Atoms and Molecules”

In Ref. [1], Donley et al. described an experiment at JILA that demonstrated atom-molecule coherence in a Bose-Einstein condensate. In a subsequent paper [2], Kokkelmans and Holland (K&H) interpreted the results of Ref. [1] using a mean-field approximation to a resonance field theory involving the atom condensate $\phi_a$, the molecular condensate $\phi_m$, and the normal and anomalous densities $G_N(r_1,r_2)$ and $G_A(r_1,r_2)$. Fig. 3 of K&H shows $|\phi_a|^2$ and $|\phi_m|^2$ as functions of time for the pulse sequence in Fig. 2. During the evolve time when the scattering length $a$ is constant, $|\phi_a|^2$ oscillates around 0.80 with an amplitude of about 0.02, while $|\phi_m|^2$ oscillates around 0.00325 with an amplitude of about 0.00030. During the subsequent second pulse, which takes a first much closer to and then farther from the Feshbach resonance, $|\phi_m|^2$ decreases by a factor of 26 and then increases by a factor of 118. The interpretation of K&H is that the molecular condensate density is orders of magnitude smaller than the atom condensate density during the evolve time and that it changes dramatically during the second pulse. They conclude that the observed oscillations involve a coherent flow of atoms between the atom condensate and the noncondensate atoms, with the molecular condensate playing only a minor role.

This interpretation is at best an awkward way of describing the physics. It is important to distinguish between the diatomic molecule in the absence of hyperfine interactions (the “Feshbach molecule”) and in the presence of those interactions (the “dimer”). The dimer is the energy eigenstate, and its binding energy near the Feshbach resonance where $a$ diverges is $E_2 \approx \hbar^2/ma^2$. The dimer can be expressed as a superposition of the Feshbach molecule and a 2-atom state: it is mostly a Feshbach molecule far from the Feshbach resonance and mostly a 2-atom state near the Feshbach resonance. If there is a molecular condensate, it will be a condensate of the dimers. Within the mean-field formalism of K&H, the appropriate expression for the number density of atoms in the dimer condensate is $2Z^{-1}|\phi_m|^2$, where the renormalization constant $Z$ is the probability for the dimer to be a Feshbach molecule.

One can obtain an analytic expression for $Z$ in the resonance field theory, because it only requires solving a 2-body problem with contact interactions:

$$Z^{-1} = 1 + \frac{m^2g_0^2}{16\pi\hbar^4(m|E_2|^{1/2})} \left[1 - a_{bg}(m|E_2|/\hbar^2)^{1/2}\right]^{-2},$$

where $g_0$ is a coupling constant, $a_{bg}$ is the off-resonant scattering length, and $E_2$ is the binding energy of the dimer. The exact result for $E_2 = \hbar^2\kappa^2/m$ is obtained by solving a cubic equation:

$$(\kappa^2 + mv_0/\hbar^2) \left[1 - a_{bg}\kappa\right] + (m^2g_0^2/8\pi\hbar^4)\kappa = 0.$$